Topic 12: CP and Gecode (Version of 13th November 2020)

Pierre Flener

Optimisation Group

Department of Information Technology Uppsala University Sweden

Course 1DL441:

Combinatorial Optimisation and Constraint Programming,

whose part 1 is Course 1DL451:

Modelling for Combinatorial Optimisation



Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linea

element

MiniModel

distinct,
nvalues,
count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

precede COCP/M4CO 12

- 1. Constraint Programming (CP)
- 2. MiniZinc to Gecode
- linear
- 4. element
- 5. MiniModel
- 6. distinct, nvalues, count
- binpacking
- 8. cumulative, unary
- 9. circuit, path
- 10. extensional
- 11. channel
- 12. precede

- 2 -



Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to

linea

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

channel

1. Constraint Programming (CP)

- 2. MiniZinc to Gecode
- 3. linear
- 4. element
- 5. MiniModel
- 6. distinct, nvalues, count
- 7. binpacking
- 8. cumulative, unary
- 9. circuit, path
- 10. extensional
- 11. channel
- 12. precede



Reminder from Topic 1: Introduction

A solving technology offers methods and tools for:

what: **Modelling** constraint problems in declarative language.

and / or

how: Solving constraint problems intelligently:

- Search: Explore the space of candidate solutions.
- Inference: Reduce the space of candidate solutions.
- Relaxation: Exploit solutions to easier problems.

A solver is a software that takes a model & data as input and tries to solve the modelled problem instance.

Constraint Programming (CP)

Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel



Constraint Programming Technology

Constraint programming (CP) offers methods and tools for:

what: Modelling constraint problems in a high-level language.

and

how: **Solving** constraint problems intelligently by:

- either default systematic search upon pushing a button
- or systematic search guided by a user-given strategy
- or local search guided by a user-given strategy

with lots of inference, called propagation in the case of systematic search, but yet little relaxation.

Slogan of CP:

Constraint Program = Model [+ Search]

Constraint Programming (CP)

Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel



CP Solving = Inference + Search

A CP solver conducts search interleaved with inference:

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linea

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

precede COCP/M4CO 12



Each constraint has an inference algorithm.



Inference for *One* Constraint: Propagator

Example

Consider the constraint CONNECTED($[C_1, ..., C_n]$), which imposes max one stretch per colour among the n variables.

From the following current partial valuation for n = 6:



a propagator (under systematic search) of the CONNECTED predicate can infer that $C_3 = \text{red}$ and $C_6 \notin \{\text{red}, \text{black}\}$:



A propagator deletes the impossible values from the current domains of the variables, and thereby accelerates otherwise blind search.

Constraint Programming (CP)

Gecode

element MiniModel

distinct,

count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel



Roadmap

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to

Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative. unarv

circuit, path

extensional channel

COCP/M4CO 12

For CP by systematic search:

- Topic 13: Consistency
 A consistency is the targeted characterisation of the domain values kept by a propagator (a musician) for a constraint, but correctness of the solver (the whole orchestra) must not depend on enforcing it.
- Topic 14: Propagation
 We define the really needed post-conditions of each propagator, and we use them to design a Propagate algorithm (for the conductor) that decides which propagator to run when.
- Topic 15: Search We design an Explore algorithm (for the conductor) that calls Propagate and a brancher.
- Topic 16: Propagators
 We design a few propagators: linear, element, distinct, extensional, ...

For CP by local search:

Topic 17: Constraint-Based Local Search



1. Constraint Programming (CP)

2. MiniZinc to Gecode

- 3. linear
- 4. element
- 5. MiniModel
- 6. distinct, nvalues, count
 - 7. binpacking
- 8. cumulative, unary
- 9. circuit, path
- 10. extensional
- 11. channel
- 12. precede

Constraint Programming (CP)

Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct,
nvalues,
count

binpacking

unary circuit,

channel



Mind the Gap

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linea

element

MiniModel distinct.

nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative,
unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

- With Gecode, which is a C++ library, one writes an imperative program that states (or: posts) via any combination of sequential, conditional, iterative, and recursive composition the declarative constraints, which are then given to the solver via propagators enforcing chosen consistencies.
- Gecode indexes from 0, and MiniZinc indexes from 1.
- Gecode does not automatically coerce Booleans (truth is 1, and falsity is 0) into integers, and MiniZinc does.
- For lighter syntax, we here omit the first argument (a space reference, often *this) from Gecode snippets.



Reification

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

precede COCP/M4CO 12 A MiniZinc reified constraint, such as r <-> x < y, where r is a variable of type bool, is modelled in Gecode by appending the reifying variable r, of type Reify, as an additional argument to the used constraint predicate:

Careful: Not all constraints are reifiable, as in all CP solvers! We will use the following definition and notation:

Definition

The reification of a constraint $\gamma(...)$ is the constraint $r \Leftrightarrow \gamma(...)$, where r is a "Boolean" variable, with the truth of $\gamma(...)$ represented by 1 and its falsity by 0.

Propagation may be poor:

see Topic 16: Propagators.



Inference: Propagator and Consistency

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

precede COCP/M4CO 12 A MiniZinc inference annotation (recall Topic 8: Inference & Search in CP & LCG) to a constraint, bounds or domain, is modelled in Gecode by appending the consistency as an additional argument to the used constraint predicate.

The options for integer decision variables are value consistency (IPL_VAL), bounds consistency (IPL_BND), and domain consistency (IPL_DOM), consistency being called integer propagation level (IPL) in Gecode, one of them being the default (IPL_DEF) if no consistency is given.

For example:

distinct (X, IPL_DOM)

For details, see Topic 13: Consistency.



Search: Selection Strategies

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

precede COCP/M4CO 12 A MiniZinc search annotation (recall Topic 8: Inference & Search in CP & LCG) to an objective, such as int_search(X, first_fail, indomain_min), is modelled in Gecode by specifying or writing a brancher.

For example:

```
branch(X, INT_VAR_SIZE_MIN(), INT_VAL_MIN())
```

For details, see Topic 15: Search.



Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

- 1. Constraint Programming (CP)
- 2. MiniZinc to Gecode
- linear
- 4. element
- 5. MiniModel
- 6. distinct, nvalues, count
- 7. binpacking
- 8. cumulative, unary
- 9. circuit, path
- 10. extensional
- 11. channel
- 12. precede



The linear Predicate

A MiniZinc linear constraint, such as the linear equality constraint sum(i in 1..n)(A[i]*X[i]) = d, can be modelled in Gecode by using its reifiable linear predicate:

Definition

A linear($[a_1, \ldots, a_n], [x_1, \ldots, x_n], R, d$) constraint, with

- $[a_1, ..., a_n]$ a sequence of non-zero integer constants,
- $[x_1,...,x_n]$ a sequence of integer variables,
- R in $\{<, \le, =, \ne, \ge, >\}$, and
- d an integer constant,

holds iff the linear relation $\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n} a_i \cdot x_i\right) R d$ holds.

Also, linear($[x_1, \ldots, x_n], R, d$) holds iff $\left(\sum_{i=1}^n x_i\right) R d$.

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel



Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel distinct,

distinct, nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

channel

1. Constraint Programming (CP)

2. MiniZinc to Gecode

3. linear

4. element

5. MiniModel

6. distinct, nvalues, count

7. binpacking

8. cumulative, unary

9. circuit, path

10. extensional

11. channel

12. precede



The element Predicate

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

element MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

precede COCP/M4CO 12 A MiniZinc constraint on an array element at an unknown index i, such as element(i, X, e) or X[i] = e or a constraint involving the expression X[i], must be modelled in Gecode by explicitly using its non-reifiable element predicate:

Definition (Van Hentenryck and Carillon, 1988)

An element $([x_1, \ldots, x_n], i, e)$ constraint, where the x_j are variables, i is an integer variable, and e is a variable, holds if and only if $x_j = e$.

Several variants exist: see the Gecode documentation.



Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

element MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

precede COCP/M4CO 12

Example (Warehouse Location Problem)

Recall the one-way channelling constraint of Model 1 (in Topic 6: Case Studies) from the Supplier variables to its non-mutually redundant Open variables:

```
constraint forall(s in Shops)
  (Open[Supplier[s]] = 1);
```

This must be modelled in Gecode as in the following MiniZinc reformulation:

```
constraint forall(s in Shops)
  (element(Supplier[s], Open, 1));
```



Example (Warehouse Location Problem, a last time)

Recall the objective of Model 1 in Topic 6: Case Studies:

This must be modelled in Gecode as in the following MiniZinc reformulation, by explicitly creating a Cost[s] variable and an element constraint for each implicit one:

```
% Cost[s] = actually incurred supply cost for s:
array[Shops] of var 0..max(SupplyCost): Cost;
constraint forall(s in Shops)
  (element(Supplier[s], SupplyCost[s,..], Cost[s]);
solve minimize maintCost * sum(Open) + sum(Cost);
```

Recall that we actually introduced these Cost[s] variables (in Topic 8: Inference & Search in CP & LCG) in order to state a maximal-regret search strategy on those variables.

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel



Example (Job allocation at minimal salary cost)

Remember the model in Topic 3: Constraint Predicates:

```
1 array[Apps] of 0..1000: Salary; % Salary[a]/job by a
2 array[Jobs] of var Apps: Worker; % job j by Worker[j]
3 solve minimize sum(j in Jobs)(Salary[Worker[j]]);
4 constraint ...; % qualifications, workload, etc
```

Line 3 must be modelled in Gecode as in the following MiniZinc reformulation, by explicitly creating a Cost[j] variable and an element constraint for each implicit one:

```
array[Jobs] of var 0..max(Salary): Cost; % Cost[j] for job j
constraint forall(j in Jobs)
  (element(Worker[j], Salary, Cost[j]));
solve minimize sum(Cost);
```

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel



- Constraint Program-
- ming (CP) MiniZinc to Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct. nvalues.

binpacking

cumulative. unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

1. Constraint Programming (CP)

2. MiniZinc to Gecode

3. linear

4. element

5. MiniModel

6. distinct, nvalues, count

7. binpacking

8. cumulative, unary

9. circuit, path

10. extensional

11. channel

12. precede



MiniModel

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

precede

- Using MiniModel, linear constraints can be formulated in Gecode like in MiniZinc: the appropriate linear constraints are then generated by the Gecode toolchain. Another useful feature will be discussed at page 37.
- Gecode has no constrained functions: everything is modelled relationally, using only constraint predicates. However, MiniModel offers some functional syntax, such as element (X, i), and the implicit variables are then generated by the Gecode toolchain.
- Gecode does not eliminate common sub-expressions: a Gecode model automatically generated by the MiniZinc toolchain can outperform a handwritten Gecode model corresponding to the MiniZinc one.



- Constraint Program-
- ming (CP) MiniZinc to Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues. count

binpacking

cumulative. unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

- 1. Constraint Programming (CP)
- 2. MiniZinc to Gecode
- 3. linear
- 4. element
- MiniModel
- 6. distinct, nvalues, count
- 7. binpacking
- 8. cumulative, unary
- 9. circuit, path
- 10. extensional
- 11. channel
- 12. precede



The distinct Predicate

A MiniZinc constraint of pairwise difference, such as alldifferent (X), can be modelled in Gecode by using its non-reifiable distinct predicate:

Definition (Laurière, 1978)

A distinct($[x_1, \ldots, x_n]$) constraint holds if and only if all the variables x_i take different values.

This is equivalent to $\frac{n \cdot (n-1)}{2}$ disequality constraints:

$$\forall i, j \in 1..n$$
 where $i < j : x_i \neq x_j$

Several variants exist: see the Gecode documentation.

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element MiniModel

distinct,

nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

channel

precede

precede COCP/M4CO 12

extensional



The nvalues Predicate

A MiniZinc constraint on the number of distinct values within an array, such as nvalue (m, X), can be modelled in Gecode by using its non-reifiable nvalues predicate:

Definition (Pachet and Roy, 1999)

An nvalues $([x_1, \ldots, x_n], R, m)$ constraint holds if and only if the number of distinct values taken by the elements of the sequence $[x_1, \dots, x_n]$ of variables is in relation R with the variable m, where R is in $\{<, \leq, =, \neq, \geq, >\}$:

$$|\{x_1,\ldots,x_n\}| R m$$

Note that *R* is '=' for the nvalue predicate of MiniZinc.

Several variants exist: see the Gecode documentation.

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct. nvalues. count

binpacking

cumulative. unarv

circuit, path

extensional channel

COCP/M4CO 12



The count Predicate

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative,
unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

precede COCP/M4CO 12 A MiniZinc constraint on value counts within an array, such as $global_cardinality(X,V,C)$, can be modelled in Gecode by using its non-reifiable count predicate:

Definition (Régin, 1996)

A count($[x_1, \ldots, x_n]$, $[c_1, \ldots, c_m]$, $[v_1, \ldots, v_m]$) constraint holds if and only if each variable c_j has the number of variables x_i that take the given value v_i .

Several variants exist: see the Gecode documentation.



- Constraint Programming (CP)
- MiniZinc to Gecode
- element
- MiniModel
- distinct. nvalues. count

binpacking

- cumulative. unary
- circuit, path

- channel
- extensional

- 1. Constraint Programming (CP)
- 2. MiniZinc to Gecode
- 3. linear
- 4. element
- MiniModel
- 6. distinct, nvalues, count
- binpacking
- 8. cumulative, unary
- 9. circuit, path
- 10. extensional
- 11. channel
- 12. precede



The binpacking Predicate

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

precede COCP/M4CO 12 A MiniZinc bin-packing constraint, such as $bin_packing_load(L,B,V)$, can be modelled in Gecode by using its non-reifiable binpacking predicate:

Definition

Let item i have the given weight or volume v_i . Let variable b_i denote the bin into which item i is put. Let variable ℓ_j denote the load of bin j. A binpacking($[\ell_1, \ldots, \ell_m], [b_1, \ldots, b_n], [v_1, \ldots, v_n]$) constraint holds iff each ℓ_i is the sum of the v_i where $b_i = j$.



There is No Knapsack Predicate in Gecode

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative,
unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

precede COCP/M4CO 12 A MiniZinc constraint on knapsack packing, such as knapsack(V,P,X,v,p), can be modelled in Gecode by using two linear constraints:

$$linear(V, X, =, v)$$

$$linear(P, X, =, p)$$

Recall that linear is reifiable.



Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linea

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

Chaimer

1. Constraint Programming (CP)

2. MiniZinc to Gecode

3. linear

4. element

5. MiniModel

6. distinct, nvalues, count

7. binpacking

8. cumulative, unary

9. circuit, path

10. extensional

11. channel

12. precede



The cumulative Predicate

A MiniZinc constraint on the bounded cumulative resource requirement of tasks, such as cumulative(S,D,R,u), can be modelled in Gecode by using its non-reifiable cumulative predicate:

Definition (Aggoun and Beldiceanu, 1993)

A cumulative $(u, [s_1, \ldots, s_n], [d_1, \ldots, d_n], [r_1, \ldots, r_n])$ constraint, where each task T_i has a starting time s_i , a duration d_i , and a resource requirement r_i , holds if and only if the resource upper limit u is never exceeded when performing the tasks T_i .

Several variants exist: see the Gecode documentation.

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linea

element MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative,
unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel



The unary Predicate

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel distinct,

nvalues.

binpacking

cumulative. unary

circuit, path

extensional channel

COCP/M4CO 12

A MiniZinc temporal non-overlap constraint on tasks, such as disjunctive (S,D), can be modelled in Gecode by using its non-reifiable unary predicate, so called because it applies to tasks requiring a unary resource:

Definition (Carlier, 1982)

A unary($[s_1, \ldots, s_n]$, $[d_1, \ldots, d_n]$) constraint, where each task T_i has a starting time s_i and a duration d_i , holds if and only if no two tasks T_i and T_i overlap in time.

Several variants exist: see the Gecode documentation.



Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linea

element
MiniModel

distinct,

nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative,
unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

- 1. Constraint Programming (CP)
- 2. MiniZinc to Gecode
- 3. linear
- 4. element
- 5. MiniModel
- 6. distinct, nvalues, count
- 7. binpacking
- 8. cumulative, unary
- 9. circuit, path
- 10. extensional
- 11. channel
- 12. precede



The circuit Predicate

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues.

binpacking

cumulative. unary

circuit, path

COCP/M4CO 12

extensional channel

A MiniZinc constraint on a Hamiltonian circuit. such as circuit (S), can be modelled in Gecode by using its non-reifiable circuit predicate:

Definition (Laurière, 1978)

A circuit($[s_1, \ldots, s_n]$) constraint holds iff the arcs $i \to s_i$ form a Hamiltonian circuit in the graph defined by the domains of the variables s_i : each vertex is visited exactly once.

Several variants exist: see the Gecode documentation.



No Subcircuit, but a Path Predicate

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linea

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

precede

A MiniZinc constraint subcircuit (S) can be modelled in Gecode as in its MiniZinc default definition, which is actually used by the Gecode backend to MiniZinc.

A MiniZinc constraint on a Hamiltonian path, such as circuit(S) / S[t] = f, can be modelled in Gecode by using its non-reifiable path predicate:

Definition

A path($[s_1, \ldots, s_n]$, f, t) constraint holds iff the arcs $i \to s_i$ form a Hamiltonian path from vertex f to vertex t in the graph defined by the domains of the variables s_i : each vertex is visited exactly once.

Several variants exist: see the Gecode documentation.



Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linea

element

MiniModel

distinct,
nvalues,
count

binpacking

cumulative,
unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

COCP/M4CO 12

precede

1. Constraint Programming (CP)

2. MiniZinc to Gecode

3. linear

4. element

5. MiniModel

6. distinct, nvalues, count

7. binpacking

cumulative, unary

9. circuit, path

10. extensional

11. channel

12. precede



The extensional Predicate

A MiniZinc constraint on membership in a table T or regular language, such as table (X,T) or regular (X,R), where R is a regular expression or a deterministic finite automaton (DFA) defining a regular language, is modelled in Gecode by using its reifiable extensional predicate:

Definition

An extensional($[x_1, \ldots, x_n], \mathcal{R}$) constraint holds if and only if the values taken by the sequence $[x_1, \ldots, x_n]$ of variables form a row of the 2d table \mathcal{R} of constants or form a string that belongs to the regular language accepted by the regular expression (when using MiniModel) or DFA \mathcal{R} .

Several variants exist: see the Gecode documentation.

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element

MiniModel

distinct, nvalues,

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit,

extensional

channel

precede



Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct. nvalues.

binpacking

cumulative. unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

1. Constraint Programming (CP)

2. MiniZinc to Gecode

3. linear

4. element

MiniModel

6. distinct, nvalues, count

7. binpacking

8. cumulative, unary

9. circuit, path

10. extensional

11. channel

12. precede



The channel Predicate

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct. nvalues.

binpacking

cumulative. unarv

path

extensional channel

COCP/M4CO 12

A MiniZinc constraint on two arrays representing a function and its inverse, such as inverse (X, Y), can be modelled in Gecode by using its non-reifiable channel predicate:

Definition

A channel $([x_1, \ldots, x_n], [y_1, \ldots, y_n])$ constraint holds iff:

$$\forall i, j \in 1..n : x_i = j \Leftrightarrow y_j = i$$

Several variants exist: see the Gecode documentation.



Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

element

MiniModel

distinct. nvalues.

binpacking

cumulative. unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel

1. Constraint Programming (CP)

2. MiniZinc to Gecode

3. linear

4. element

MiniModel

6. distinct, nvalues, count

7. binpacking

8. cumulative, unary

9. circuit, path

10. extensional

11. channel

12. precede



The precede Predicate

A MiniZinc constraint value_precede (v, w, X) and its generalisation value_precede_chain (V, X), which are useful for breaking value symmetries, can be modelled in Gecode by using its non-reifiable precede predicate:

Definition

A precede($[x_1, \ldots, x_n], v, w$) constraint holds iff the first occurrence, if any, of value v precedes the first occurrence, if any, of value w among the variables x_i .

Definition

A precede($[x_1, \ldots, x_n]$, $[v_1, \ldots, v_m]$) constraint holds iff the first occurrence, if any, of every value v_i precedes the first occurrence, if any, of value v_{i+1} among the variables x_i .

Constraint Programming (CP)

MiniZinc to Gecode

linear

element MiniModel

WITHWOO

distinct, nvalues, count

binpacking

cumulative, unary

circuit, path

extensional

channel