About the C coding exam 2019-01-14.

// Imperative and Object-Oriented Programming Methodology

// Uppsala University - Copyright © 2019 Henrik Alfken(Schulze)

Seeing a solved coding exam does not automatically mean it is easy to understand how the coder arrived at that particular solution. Here is a rather detailed narrative about my efforts to solve the C coding exam of 2019-01-14. I use Bash on Windows (Windows Subsystem for Linux) inside ConEmu, because I find it convenient, <u>https://conemu.github.io/en/BashOnWindows.html</u>. As text editor I (mainly) use Geany which is easy to use and available on the department's linux servers. I have installed the Geany-plugin "Save Actions" because it is very convenient to have files saved as soon as focus is lost. (One thing less to think about when jumping back and forth between the text editor and the terminal.)

1. Check what TO DO.

Open a terminal at uppgift1 , and type grep -irn 'todo' , like so:

<path-to-here>/uppgift1\$ grep -irn 'todo'
yourcode.c:29: /// TODO: lägg till enligt spec
yourcode.c:39: /// TODO: lägg till enligt spec
yourcode.c:50: /// TODO: frivillig hjälpfunktion
yourcode.c:59: /// TODO: lägg till enligt spec

Taking a look inside the file yourcode.c shows that line 29 concerns treemap_insert(), line 39 is about treemap_lookup(), line 50 concerns node_destroy(), and line 59 treemap_destroy().

2. Read (and copy-paste) the specifications.

A natural step to follow is to check out the specifications for these three public functions – insert, lookup, and destroy – as given on lines 11-22 of treemap.h:

```
/// Removes the treemap from memory, but does not call
/// free on any value pointer passed to it.
void treemap_destroy(treemap_t *);
/// Insert value v under key k in the tree -- if there is
/// already a value v' with key k, return v' and replace
/// v' with v in the tree.
void *treemap_insert(treemap_t *t, int k, void *v);
/// Return the value associated with key k in the tree.
/// If key k is not in the tree, return NULL.
void *treemap_lookup(treemap_t *t, int k);
```

By copy-pasting the specifications above to treemap.c, it will be handy to have them easily available while writing code.

For example, treemap_insert() will then look like the following:

```
/// Insert value v under key k in the tree -- if there is
/// already a value v' with key k, return v' and replace
/// v' with v in the tree.
void *treemap_insert(treemap_t *t, int key, void *value)
{
    /// TODO: lägg till enligt spec
    /// Remember there are instructions in the exam text
    /// for how to implement insert
    /// Hint: use a recursive help function (or double pointers)
    return NULL;
}
```

3. Run the tests and fix the first bug encountered.

Running the tests is straight-forward:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ make clean && make memtest
rm -f *.o a.out
gcc -Wall -g yourcode.c driver.c
... yada, yada, yada ...
==146== ERROR SUMMARY: 1 errors from 1 contexts (suppressed: 0 from 0)
Makefile:8: recipe for target 'memtest' failed
make: *** [memtest] Segmentation fault (core dumped)
```

Wow! - The intimidating Segmentation fault has honored us with its presence. But no time for whining. Use gdb to help finding out what went wrong:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ gdb ./a.out
GNU gdb (Ubuntu 7.11.1-0ubuntu1~16.5) 7.11.1
... yada, yada, yada ...
<http://www.gnu.org/software/gdb/documentation/>.
For help, type "help".
Type "apropos word" to search for commands related to "word"...
Reading symbols from ./a.out...done.
(gdb)
```

Type run to run the program again, but this time inside gdb :

```
(gdb) run
Starting program: /mnt/c/sz/dit/ioopm/kp-solved/kodprov-2019-01-14/hesc0353C/uppgift1/a.out
Program received signal SIGSEGV, Segmentation fault.
0x000000000400847 in node_size (n=0x0, acc=0x7ffffffee4e4) at yourcode.c:124
124 if (n->left != NULL) node_size(n->left, acc);
(gdb)
```

We may want to see a backtrace to help orient inside what function the crash occured:

- Aha! Function main() on line 232 in driver.c calls test_basic(), which on line 24 in driver.c calls treemap_size() in yourcode.c. Which in turn calls node_size() on line 135. Finally, the program crashes on line 124 inside function node_size(node_t *n, int *acc) with argument values being n=0x0 (=NULL) and acc=0x7ffffffee4e4.

Line 124 reads if $(n->left != NULL) \dots$ which explains the crash. – After all, how could the compiler tell what n->left is, if n=NULL? – NULL->left hardly makes any sense! As a side note, Java would have given the friendlier (and much more informative) *NullPointerException*.

So the problem is a missing check that the variable n may not be NULL when arriving at line 124. An easy fix is to copy-paste line 100 – if (n == NULL) return; – to line 122.

4. Run the tests again, and again, and again - test_basic().

Re-running the tests now yields:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ make clean && make memtest
rm -f *.o a.out
... yada, yada, yada ...
==172== ERROR SUMMARY: 18 errors from 18 contexts (suppressed: 0 from 0)
```

Yay. - Still 18 errors, but at least we don't get the Segmentation fault any more. (Yay!)

Let us adapt a test-driven approach and comment out all tests except the first one. The last lines of driver.c will then look like:

```
int main(void)
{
   test_basic();
   //test_size();
   //test_keys_1();
   //test_keys_2();
   //test_has_keys();
   //test_lookup();
   puts("\nIf no errors are printed above -- all tests pass!");
}
```

Re-running the tests again yields:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ make clean && make memtest
rm -f *.o a.out
... yada, yada, yada ...
==184== HEAP SUMMARY:
==184== in use at exit: 8 bytes in 1 blocks
==184== total heap usage: 2 allocs, 1 frees, 4,104 bytes allocated
==184==
==184== 8 bytes in 1 blocks are definitely lost in loss record 1 of 1
==184== at 0x4C2F988: calloc (vg_replace_malloc.c:711)
==184== by 0x4006DD: treemap_create (yourcode.c:50)
==184== by 0x400908: test basic (driver.c:23)
==184== by 0x4021AE: main (driver.c:232)
==184==
==184== LEAK SUMMARY:
==184== definitely lost: 8 bytes in 1 blocks
==184== indirectly lost: 0 bytes in 0 blocks
==184== possibly lost: 0 bytes in 0 blocks
==184== still reachable: 0 bytes in 0 blocks
==184==
              suppressed: 0 bytes in 0 blocks
==184==
==184== For counts of detected and suppressed errors, rerun with: -v
==184== ERROR SUMMARY: 1 errors from 1 contexts (suppressed: 0 from 0)
```

- Valgrind says memory is allocateed which is never released again. To be more precise, the function treemap_create() is called on line 23 of driver.c, and on line 50 of yourcode.c memory is allocated for a treemap:

return calloc(1, sizeof(treemap_t));

- Where is this memory deallocated / released again?

To find out:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ grep -irn 'free('
driver.c:80: free(keys);
driver.c:119: free(keys);
```

- So the answer is: nowhere!

Double-check:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ grep -irn 'alloc('
yourcode.c:21: node_t *n = calloc(1, sizeof(node_t));
yourcode.c:50: return calloc(1, sizeof(treemap_t));
yourcode.c:111: int *keys = calloc(treemap_size(t) + 1, sizeof(int));
```

Line 21 of yourcode.c is inside the function node_new(), which is currently not called from anywhere.

(How can you tell?¹) And the keys variable allocated on line 111 of yourcode.c inside the treemap_keys() function is clearly released on lines 80 and 119 of driver.c as shown a few lines up from here.

The function treemap_keys() is called twice from driver.c , which can be confirmed:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ grep -irn 'treemap_keys(' driver.c
72: int *keys = treemap_keys(t);
110: int *keys = treemap_keys(t);
```

4a. Deallocate the memory of an empty tree.

The function treemap_destroy() is called on line 25 of driver.c, clearly with the intent of freeing up all memory allocated for the tree. Line 23 of driver.c just creates an empty tree, so in this case there is no need to free any memory inside the tree, only the tree itself.

This is easy to do by just adding the following after line 66:

free(t);

Doing this, and then re-running the tests yields:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ make clean && make memtest
rm -f *.o a.out
... yada, yada, yada ...
==238== All heap blocks were freed -- no leaks are possible
==238==
==238==
==238== For counts of detected and suppressed errors, rerun with: -v
==238== ERROR SUMMARY: 0 errors from 0 contexts (suppressed: 0 from 0)
```

- Hooray! The messages no leaks are possible and 0 errors from 0 contexts are exactly what we want to see. So test_basic() now passes.

5. Run the tests again - test_size().

Now uncomment the next test, test_size():

```
int main(void)
{
   test_basic();
   test_size();
   //test_keys_1();
   //test_keys_2();
   //test_has_keys();
   //test_lookup();
   puts("\nIf no errors are printed above -- all tests pass!");
}
```

But take one baby-step at a time – start slowly by inserting *just one* element into the tree. The test will then look as follows:

```
void test size()
{
 treemap t *t = treemap create();
 treemap_insert(t, 5, "String value");
  assert_eq(treemap_size(t), 1);
 //treemap_insert(t, 2, "String value");
 //assert eq(treemap size(t), 2);
 //treemap insert(t, 8, "String value");
  //assert_eq(treemap_size(t), 3);
 //treemap_insert(t, 6, "String value");
 //assert_eq(treemap_size(t), 4);
 //treemap_insert(t, 4, "String value");
 //assert_eq(treemap_size(t), 5);
 //treemap_insert(t, 1, "String value");
 //assert_eq(treemap_size(t), 6);
 //treemap_insert(t, 32, "String value");
 //assert_eq(treemap_size(t), 7);
  treemap_destroy(t);
}
```

Re-running the tests yields:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ make clean && make memtest
rm -f *.o a.out
... yada, yada, yada ...
Assertion failed: expected 1, got 0
... yada, yada, yada ...
```

| driver.c:32 (test_size)

- Well. What did you expect? We have not yet implemented insertions of any elements into the tree. (!)

5a. Insert just one element into the tree.

Line 8 of yourcode.c tells that a treemap has a node called root :

```
typedef struct node node_t;
struct treemap
{
   node_t *root;
};
```

Where a node is defined in lines 11-17 of yourcode.c:

```
struct node
{
    int key;
    void *value;
    node_t *left;
    node_t *right;
};
```

As already touched upon, a helper function for creating and allocating memory for a new node is defined in lines 19-25 of yourcode.c:

```
static node_t *node_new(int key, void *value)
{
    node_t *n = calloc(1, sizeof(node_t)); // Line 21 of yourcode.c
    n->key = key;
    n->value = value;
    return n;
}
```

So to create a tree that contains *just one* element, let the root of the tree be the node that holds the element:

```
/// Insert value v under key k in the tree -- if there is
/// already a value v' with key k, return v' and replace
/// v' with v in the tree.
void *treemap_insert(treemap_t *t, int key, void *value)
{
    /// TODO: lägg till enligt spec
    /// Remember there are instructions in the exam text
    /// for how to implement insert
    /// Hint: use a recursive help function (or double pointers)
    t->root = node_new(key, value);
    return NULL;
}
```

It may be noted that the left and right attributes / pointers of the single root node are both NULL. This is because calloc rather than malloc is used to allocate memory on line 21 of yourcode.c.

Re-running the tests again yields:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ make clean && make memtest
rm -f *.o a.out
... yada, yada, yada ...
If no errors are printed above -- all tests pass!
==274===274== HEAP SUMMARY:
==274==
         in use at exit: 32 bytes in 1 blocks
==274== total heap usage: 4 allocs, 3 frees, 4,144 bytes allocated
==274==
==274== 32 bytes in 1 blocks are definitely lost in loss record 1 of 1
==274== at 0x4C2F988: calloc (vg replace malloc.c:711)
==274== by 0x400683: node_new (yourcode.c:21)
==274== by 0x4006C6: treemap insert (yourcode.c:36)
==274== by 0x4009BC: test size (driver.c:31)
==274== by 0x401FBF: main (driver.c:233)
==274==
==274== LEAK SUMMARY:
==274== definitely lost: 32 bytes in 1 blocks
==274== indirectly lost: 0 bytes in 0 blocks
==274== possibly lost: 0 bytes in 0 blocks
==274== still reachable: 0 bytes in 0 blocks
==274==
              suppressed: 0 bytes in 0 blocks
==274==
==274== For counts of detected and suppressed errors, rerun with: -v
==274== ERROR SUMMARY: 1 errors from 1 contexts (suppressed: 0 from 0)
```

Good. – "All tests pass!" (Which refers only to the tests that are currently turned on.) The leaking memory should come as no surprise: recall from the previous section how we deliberately constructed the function treemap_destroy() to free up memory for the tree, *but not for any of its elements*.

This needs to change now. Free up the root as well – free(t->root); - and rerun the tests to see if this remedies the memory leakage. (It should!)

5b. Deallocate the memory of *all* elements in the tree.

Now try a recursive approach to free up the memory of **all** nodes in the tree.

It may come in handy with some inspiration from treemap_size() which recursively calls node_size():

```
/// Helper function for treemap_size
static void node_size(node_t *n, int *acc)
{
    /// Postorder traversal
    if (n == NULL) return;
    /// Recurse into left subtree
    if (n->left != NULL) node_size(n->left, acc);
    /// Recurse into right subtree
    if (n->right != NULL) node_size(n->right, acc);
    /// Increment the accumulator
    *acc += 1;
}
```

Simply copy-paste the body of node_size() into node_destroy(), change the recursive calls to call node_destroy() rather than node_size(), remove the acc argument when calling recursively, and adjust to code to free memory of the current node instead of incrementing an accumulator:

```
/// Helper function for treemap destroy
static void node_destroy(node_t *n)
{
 /// TODO: frivillig hjälpfunktion
 /// Hint -- use this as a helper function to treemap destroy
 /// Implement it as a recursive function that first visits
 /// the subtrees and then destroys n
 /// Postorder traversal
 if (n == NULL) return;
 /// Recurse into left subtree
 if (n->left != NULL) node destroy(n->left);
 /// Recurse into right subtree
 if (n->right != NULL) node destroy(n->right);
 /// Free the memory of the current node n:
 free(n);
}
```

Oh! - And don't forget to call node_destroy() from within treemap_destroy():

```
/// Removes the treemap from memory, but does not call
/// free on any value pointer passed to it.
void treemap_destroy(treemap_t *t)
{
    /// TODO: lägg till enligt spec
    //free(t->root);
    node_destroy(t->root);
    free(t);
}
```

Again rerun the tests to see:

```
cpath-to-here>/uppgift1$ make clean && make memtest
rm -f *.o a.out
... yada, yada, yada ...
If no errors are printed above -- all tests pass!
==330==
==330== HEAP SUMMARY:
==330== in use at exit: 0 bytes in 0 blocks
==330== total heap usage: 4 allocs, 4 frees, 4,144 bytes allocated
==330==
==330== All heap blocks were freed -- no leaks are possible
==330==
==330== For counts of detected and suppressed errors, rerun with: -v
==330== ERROR SUMMARY: 0 errors from 0 contexts (suppressed: 0 from 0)
```

- Yay, all tests pass! + no leaks are possible + 0 errors from 0 contexts = sweet!

Unfortunately, this proves only that treemap_destroy() works for *one single* element. If shit happens and the program fails later when inserting more elements, we will have to keep an open mind as to whether the error depends on treemap_destroy() or on treemap_insert() (or *both*).

5c. Insert more than one element into the tree.

Although the implementation of treemap_destroy() has not yet been confirmed to be correct for more than one element, it is reasonable to apply a similar recursive approach for treemap_insert().

One possibility is to copy-paste node_destroy() and rename it into a completely new recursive function node_insert(), keeping just the skeleton, but adding the key-value pair as parameters, and having it return a node:

```
/// Helper function for treemap_insert:
static node_t *node_insert(node_t *n, int key, void *value)
{
    /// Hint -- use this as a helper function for treemap_insert().
    /// Implement it as a recursive function that either:
    /// 1) inserts a new node with the demanded key and value pointer, or
    /// 2) if the key already exists: replaces the value pointer, or
    /// 3) continues the search in the subtrees.
    if (n == NULL) ; // <-- Insert a new node here.
    else ; // Check if key exists, if not continue searching the subtrees.
    return NULL;
}
```

Even with the strange looking code above, the program still compiles and runs.

What next? How do we check the key and then traverse the subtrees if the key is not the right one?

The observant reader will notice a hint in the code given in yourcode.c which is currently on line 93:

```
/// Hint: look at this function for inspiration
bool treemap_has_key(treemap_t *t, int key)
{
  node t *n = t->root;
  while (n)
   {
      if (n->key == key) return true; // currently line 100 of yourcode.c
      if (n->key > key)
        {
          n = n->left;
        }
      else
        {
          n = n->right;
                                       // currently line 109 of yourcode.c
        }
   }
 /// If we came here without finding it, it can't exist
  return false;
}
```

Of particular interest to a recursive approach are the if and else clauses, currently lines 100-109. Copy-paste those lines into the newly created function node insert(), and adjust the code slightly:

```
/// Helper function for treemap_insert:
static node_t *node_insert(node_t *n, int key, void *value)
{
 /// Hint -- use this as a helper function for treemap insert().
 /// Implement it as a recursive function that either:
 /// 1) inserts a new node with the demanded key and value pointer, or
 /// 2) if the key already exists: replaces the value pointer, or
 /// 3) continues the search in the subtrees.
 if (n == NULL)
   {
                          // If no such key, insert a new node here:
      n = node new(key, value);
   }
  else if (n->key == key) // Else check if the key already exists ...
   {
      n->value = value; // ... if it does, replace the value pointer ...
   }
  else if (n->key > key) // ... if not, try inserting into the left subtree ...
   {
      n->left = node insert(n->left, key, value);
   }
  else if (n->key < key) // ... -- OR -- into the right subtree if key is BIG.
   {
      n->right = node_insert(n->right, key, value);
   }
  return n;
}
```

Again, remember to update treemap_insert() so that it calls the recursive function node_insert() :

```
/// Insert value v under key k in the tree -- if there is
/// already a value v' with key k, return v' and replace
/// v' with v in the tree.
void *treemap_insert(treemap_t *t, int key, void *value)
{
    /// TODO: lägg till enligt spec
    /// Remember there are instructions in the exam text
    /// for how to implement insert
    /// Hint: use a recursive help function (or double pointers)
    //t->root = node_new(key, value);
    t->root = node_insert(t->root, key, value);
    return NULL;
}
```

Next, rerun the tests to see all tests pass! + no leaks are possible + 0 errors from 0 contexts.

OK, good. But remember – there is still only *one* element inserted in test_size(). To see if it works with more elements, we need to uncomment lines 33-44 of driver.c, like so:

```
void test_size()
{
 treemap_t *t = treemap_create();
 treemap_insert(t, 5, "String value");
  assert eq(treemap size(t), 1);
 treemap insert(t, 2, "String value");
 assert_eq(treemap_size(t), 2);
 treemap_insert(t, 8, "String value");
 assert_eq(treemap_size(t), 3);
 treemap_insert(t, 6, "String value");
 assert eq(treemap size(t), 4);
 treemap_insert(t, 4, "String value");
 assert eq(treemap size(t), 5);
 treemap_insert(t, 1, "String value");
 assert_eq(treemap_size(t), 6);
 treemap_insert(t, 32, "String value");
 assert eq(treemap size(t), 7);
 treemap_destroy(t);
}
```

- Yay, still getting all tests pass! + no leaks are possible + 0 errors from 0 contexts = nice!

6. Run the tests again - test_keys_1(), test_keys_2(), test_has_keys().

Now uncomment the next three tests, test_keys_1(), test_keys_2(), test_has_keys():

```
int main(void)
{
   test_basic();
   test_size();
   test_keys_1();
   test_keys_2();
   test_has_keys();
   //test_lookup();
   puts("\nIf no errors are printed above -- all tests pass!");
}
```

- Still getting all tests pass! + no leaks are possible + 0 errors from 0 contexts = no problem!

7. Run the tests again - test_lookup().

We have not yet implemented treemap_lookup() so there is no way we could expect that test to pass.

The function treemap_lookup() currently looks like:

```
/// Return the value associated with key k in the tree.
/// If key k is not in the tree, return NULL.
void *treemap_lookup(treemap_t *t, int key)
{
    /// TODO: lägg till enligt spec
    return NULL;
}
```

The treemap_lookup() function is actually rather similar to treemap_size() along with its helper function:

```
/// Helper function for treemap size
static void node_size(node_t *n, int *acc)
{
 /// Postorder traversal
 if (n == NULL) return;
 /// Recurse into left subtree
 if (n->left != NULL) node_size(n->left, acc);
 /// Recurse into right subtree
 if (n->right != NULL) node size(n->right, acc);
 /// Increment the accumulator
  *acc += 1;
}
int treemap_size(treemap_t *t)
{
 int result = 0;
 node_size(t->root, &result);
  return result;
}
```

But for the lookup, the helper function should take not the address of an accumulator, but a key and the *address* of a value pointer as parameters. There is already a function that does almost that, namely the function node_insert().

So copy-paste the function node_insert() into a new function node_lookup() and adjust the code slightly. Also update treemap_lookup() to work in a similar way as treemap_size():

```
/// Helper function for treemap_lookup:
static node_t *node_lookup(node_t *n, int key, void** adr_of_value)
{
 /// Hint -- use this as a helper function for treemap lookup().
 /// Implement it as a recursive function that:
 /// 1) if the key is found: updates the value pointer, or
 /// 2) continues the search in the subtrees.
 if (n != NULL)
   {
     if (n->key == key) // Check if the key is in this node,
       {
         *adr_of_value = n->value; // if it is, update the value pointer,
       }
     else if (n->key > key)
                                 // if not, try searching the left subtree,
       {
         n->left = node_lookup(n->left, key, adr_of_value);
       }
     else if (n->key < key) // or the right subtree.
       {
         n->right = node_lookup(n->right, key, adr_of_value);
       }
   }
 return n;
}
/// Return the value associated with key k in the tree.
/// If key k is not in the tree, return NULL.
void *treemap_lookup(treemap_t *t, int key)
{
 /// TODO: lägg till enligt spec
 void* result = NULL;
 t->root = node_lookup(t->root, key, &result);
 return result;
}
```

The time has come to uncomment the last test, test_lookup():

```
int main(void)
{
   test_basic();
   test_size();
   test_keys_1();
   test_keys_2();
   test_has_keys();
   test_lookup();
   puts("\nIf no errors are printed above -- all tests pass!");
}
```

Finally run the tests again, this time literally *all* of them:

```
<path-to-here>/uppgift1$ make clean && make memtest
rm -f *.o a.out
... yada, yada, yada ...
If no errors are printed above -- all tests pass!
==139==
==139== HEAP SUMMARY:
==139== in use at exit: 0 bytes in 0 blocks
==139== total heap usage: 44 allocs, 44 frees, 5,328 bytes allocated
==139==
==139== All heap blocks were freed -- no leaks are possible
==139==
==139== For counts of detected and suppressed errors, rerun with: -v
==139== ERROR SUMMARY: 0 errors from 0 contexts (suppressed: 0 from 0)
```

- Getting all tests pass! + no leaks are possible + 0 errors from 0 contexts = everything is OK!

That's it!

8. Ignoring specifications - treemap_insert().

Wait a minute!

What about the specifications for treemap_insert() given by lines 15-17 of treemap.h? Those that say: "if there is already a value v' with key k, return v' and replace v' with v in the tree"?

```
/// Insert value v under key k in the tree -- if there is
/// already a value v' with key k, return v' and replace
/// v' with v in the tree.
void *treemap insert(treemap t *t, int k, void *v);
```

Is this really implemented?

No. I ignored it. For two reasons. One reason is that the specification does not explicitly tell what should be returned if there is **not** already a value (pointer) with key k. (A natural assumption would be to return NULL in that case.) Also, there are no tests to check if this functionality has been implemented. And thirdly, this is easy to implement by using the same technique as for treemap_lookup() above. If you really care, I do propose a solution at http://user.it.uu.se/~hesc0353/ioopm/kodprov-2019-12-10.zip.

Cheers! /Henke, henke.uu.se@inbox.lv

Uppsala, 2019-12-31.

grep -irn 'node_new(' yourcode.c